

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS
EASTERN DIVISION**

STACY ERNST, DAWN HOARD, IRENE
RES-PULLANO, MICHELLE LAHALIH, and
KATHERINE KEAN,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF CHICAGO,

Defendant.

Case No.: 08 C 4370

Judge Charles R. Norgle, Sr.

Magistrate Judge Jeffrey Cole

STIPULATION – AGREED EXHIBITS

The Plaintiffs, Stacy Ernst, Dawn Hoard, Irene Res-Pullano, Michelle Lahalih, and Katherine Kean, and the Defendant, the City of Chicago (the “City”) stipulate and agree that subject to relevance objections, the following exhibits identified in the Final Pre-Trial Order are received in evidence without objections, without the need for further foundation and may be published to the jury.

PLAINTIFFS

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
1	2004 announcement of opening	ERN 262-3, Hoard Dep Ex. 1	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
2A	Plaintiffs’ paramedic licenses and materials submitted for background and drug check	ERN 276-ERN 295	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
2B	Plaintiffs' paramedic licenses and materials submitted for background and drug check	ERN 296-319	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
2C	Plaintiffs' paramedic licenses and materials submitted for background and drug check	ERN 320-340	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
2D	Plaintiffs' paramedic licenses and materials submitted for background and drug check	ERN 341-364	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
2E	Plaintiffs' paramedic licenses and materials submitted for background and drug check	ERN 365-388	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
3A	July 2004 letter announcing August 2004 test	Hoard Dep Ex 3.	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
3B		ERN 347 (Lahalih)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
3C		ERN 303 (Ernst)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
3D		ERN 329 (Kean)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 53:18 – 53:23.)
3E		-ERN 374 (Res)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:16.)
4	Brochure regarding test sent to plaintiffs	Hoard Dep. Ex. No. 5 Plaintiffs_ID_0000 188-195	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
5A	September 2004 letters re “failure” of test	ERN 364 (Lahalih)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
5B		ERN 319 (Ernst)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
5C		ERN 340 (Kean)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
5D		ERN 388 (Res)	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
6	Notice to City (Hurovitz) regarding 2000 test results	ERN 1270	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
7	HPS notice to City regarding 2001 test results	ERN 1191-1197	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 54:17 – 54:18.)
8	HPS email to City of 2004 test results – attachment to email not produced by City	ERN 4535	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 57:2 – 57:6.)
9	HPS summary to City regarding 2000 to 2007 test results	ERN 506-556	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 57:2 – 57:6.)
10	HPS summary to City 2008 to 2009 test results	ERN 557-560	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 57:2 – 57:6.)
11A	Chart provided by Swann/ Preston to Gebhardt summarizing number of paramedic hires 1996-1999	ERN 11224 Plaintiffs_PTO_000 099	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 57:18.)
11B		ERN 11806 ERN 11808 Emails from Anne Preston to Gebhardt and from T. Swabb	Received into Evidence in its Modified Form, with Exhibit 11B consisting of ERN 11806 and ERN 11808, without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 63:10 – 64:18.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
12	Backup documents for hiring summary provided Gebhardt from City attorneys	ERN 11809-11820	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
13	Documents transmitted to Gebhardt from CFD regarding hiring process	Gebhardt 3/15/2012 deposition, exhibit 9 ERN010955-ERN010957	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
14A	Documents transmitted to Gebhardt from CFD regarding academy Curriculum, workload and assignments	Gebhardt 3/15/2012 deposition, Exhibit 6 ERN 2813-ERN 2863	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
14B		Gebhardt 3/15/2012 deposition, Exhibit 7 ERN 4953-ERN 4975, Unnumbered page	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
14C		Gebhardt 3/15/2012 deposition, Exhibit 8 ERN 2768-ERN 2812 Plaintiffs_PTO_000 173- Plaintiffs_PTO_000 217	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
15	City document regarding acquisition of new ambulances and Stryker Cots 2004-2005	Plaintiffs_PTO_000 230- Plaintiffs_PTO_000 246	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
16	City document regarding changes in dispatch protocols June 2000.	Campion dep. ex. 24 Plaintiffs_PTO_000 250- Plaintiffs_PTO_000 269	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
16B		Campion dep. ex. 25 Plaintiffs_PTO_000 270- Plaintiffs_PTO_000 272	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 59:2 – 59:5.)
18a	Fax to Howe from Gebhardt 4/12/2000	ERN 1999- 2000	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 74:18 – 74:22.)
18B	Fax to Howe from Gebhardt 6/18/2001	ERN 5192-93 6	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 74:24 – 74:25.)
19	City documents regarding number of candidates needed for validation study and equipment		Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 75:1 – 75:4.)
19A	2/25/98 Agenda for initial PAT project meeting	Gebhardt Ex. 10 ERN 4916-ERN 4917	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 75:1 – 75:4.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
19B	7/7/98 letter Gebhardt to Howe	Gebhardt Ex. 11 ERN 2581-ERN 2592	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 75:1 – 75:4.)
19C	2/5/99 Fax from Howe to Gebhardt	Gebhardt Ex. 12 ERN 2533-ERN 2542	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 75:1 – 75:4.)
19E	Howe Notes	Gebhardt Ex. 14 ERN 4707	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 79:14 – 79:16.)
20	Swabb and Preston to Gebhardt Jacobs 7/19/2012	ERN 11799-11805	Received into evidence without objection. (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 84:15 – 84:18.)
24	8/17/99 HPS Proposal for test administration, Gebhardt to Stensland	ERN 1280-1283	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 87:7.)
31	CPAT orientation guide		Received into Evidence subject to the parties' filed stipulation dated Feb. 26, 2014, Dkt. No. 381. (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 88:21 – 89:4.)
38	Collective bargaining agreements with City 2005 to present	ERN 70-246	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 113:16 -113:17.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
39		VAS 1-182	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 113:16 -113:17.)
39A	New CBA		
41	Appendix A to Gebhardt 1999 validation study		Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 114:17.)
42	Excel spreadsheet of scores 2000 to 2009	Produced as part of Campion report production as “2000-2005 excel spreadsheet scores.0320.xls” and “2008-2009 excel spreadsheet.recheck.xls”	Received into Evidence over Defendant’s Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 114:25 – 114:17.)
44	Plaintiffs score sheets from 2004 test	ERN 561-565	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 117:7.)
45	Hiring history for 2004 applicants	ERN 3402-3408	Received into Evidence provided Plaintiffs redact the names of individuals where appropriate and necessary and subject to agreement on substitute identifiers. (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 119:22- 120:23.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
46	City list of test administrators	ERN 3971-2	Received into Evidence provided Plaintiffs redact the addresses of individuals. (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 121:6.)
47	2006 to 2013 City of Chicago overtime reports		Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 121:8.)
50A-C	Berry revised reports 02092013 1 to 3		Received into Evidence without Objection (April 17, 2014 Hearing)
51	Gebhardt August 17, 1999 proposal to Stensland	ERN 2013-2016	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)
52	Gebhardt to Howe June 18, 2001	ERN 2727-2728	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)
53	HPS Copy of scales	ERN 2923-2932	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)
54	2/26/1998 meeting notes	ERN 2893-2895	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
55	8/4/2004 note re VHS tape	ERN 4004	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)
56	Gebhardt to Howe	ERN 2745-2746	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:16 – 130:18.)
57	Gebhardt to Noys	ERN 4014	Received into Evidence over Defendant's Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 130:24 – 134:3.)
59	Injury report re male participant in “validation study”	ERN4662-4667	Received into Evidence Provided Plaintiffs excise the first page with the handwritten note (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 135:21 – 137:10.)
60	Reconstructed data from files produced as CHICVAL Excel format		Received into Evidence without objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 137:12 – 139:4.)
61	Reconstructed data from records in excel format as EMSCOMB		Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 139:5 – 139:9.)
62	Howe notes	Howe dep Ex. 4 ERN 3043-3057	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 77:15 – 77:19; 139:10.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
63	Demonstrative exhibit	City of Chicago PPT equipment	Received as a Demonstrative Aid, subject to Judge Norgle's determinations on how it may be used, over Defendant's objections (Feb. 25, 2014 A.M. Tr. 2:4 – 4:15; Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 139:12 – 139:25.)
66	Dr. Michael Campion Curriculum Vitae		Received as are all expert resumes unless Judge Norgle disagrees Tr. Feb 25, 2014 PM P 147:23 to 148:14
67	Dr. William McArdle Curriculum Vitae		Received as are all expert resumes unless Judge Norgle disagrees Tr. Feb 25, 2014 PM P 147:23 to 148:14

Defendants

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
10	3/18/96 Letter from Dr. Gebhardt to Adrienne Bryant regarding project detail	ERN 4934-4937	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 161:3.)
11	Human Performance Systems, Inc.'s October 29, 1996 Proposal to the City of Chicago Department of Law, Labor Division For The Development Of A Physical Abilities Test For Selection Of City Of Chicago Paramedics	ERN 4373-4420 3/15/12 Geb. Dep. Ex. 1	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 162:9 – 162:11.)
12	3/21/97 Memo from Adrienne Bryant to John O'Brien regarding sole source justification for Human Performance Systems	ERN 11618	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 165:3 – 165:6.)
13	Purchasing Department documents for CFD Paramedic physical abilities test	ERN 4323-4386	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 165:7 – 165:18.)
14	Professional Service Agreement Between the Chicago Fire Department and Human Performance Systems, Inc. for Development of PAT	ERN 4185-4283	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' objections (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 166:4 - 166:10.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
15	Professional Services Agreement Between the Chicago Fire Department and Human Performance Systems, Inc. for Administration of PAT	ERN 389-494 5-27-10 Geb. Dep. Ex. 1	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' objections. (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 166:11 -166:14.)
16	1/25/98 Tentative EMS/PAT Schedule	ERN 1216-1217	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:10.)
17	2/2/98 Letter from Gebhardt to Stensland regarding February 25 to 27, 1998 initial development meetings	ERN 4927-4933 3-15-12 Geb. Dep. Ex. 5	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:12 - 168:14.)
18	2/10/98 Letter from Joyce to Gebhardt enclosing documents relating to Chicago Fire Department's Emergency Medical Services System	ERN 2813-2863 3-15-12 Geb. Dep. Ex. 6	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:12 - 168:14.)
19	2/10/98 Letter from Joyce to Gebhardt enclosing documents relating to Chicago Fire Department's Emergency Medical Services System	ERN 4953-4975+ 3-15-12 Geb. Dep. Ex. 7	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:12 - 168:14.)
20	2/25/98 Agenda - PAT Initial Meeting	ERN 1214-1215	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:15 - 168:16.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
21	2/26/98-2/27/98 EMS Physical Performance Test Development Schedule for Initial Consultant Visit	ERN 1203	Received into Evidence without Objection Provided Defendant Redacts the Handwritten Notes (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 168:17 -169:14.)
22	3/17/98 Letter from Baker to Howe and 3/26/98 Letter from Howe to Gebhardt and Attached Task List with Comments	ERN 2635 - 2708	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 169:15 – 169:17.)
23	3/98 Memo from Stensland to Altman with Overtime Cost Breakdown Regarding validation Study	ERN 5006-5007	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 170:17 – 170:18.)
24	4/10/98 Letter from Baker to Howe with Questionnaire Attached	ERN 1241-1269	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 170:19 – 170:20.)
25	5/8/98 Letter from Howe to Gebhardt with ID of paramedics who completed task inventories	ERN 2987-2995	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 170:25 – 171:1.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
26	6/29/98 Schedule for consultant visit	ERN 4920-21	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 171:2 – 171:3.)
28	Overtime Compensatory Reports for March 1998 PAT Development	ERN 5249-5256	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 172:18 – 173:4.)
29	Overtime Compensatory Reports for May 1998 PAT Development	ERN 5008-5125	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:7 – 173:12.)
30	Overtime Compensatory Reports for June 1998 PAT Development	ERN 5204-5221	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:7 – 173:12.)
31	7/27/98 Memo from Stensland re Building Equipment	ERN 1905-1907	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:13 – 173:17.)
32	2/20/99 Letter from Gebhardt to Howe re Equipment Needed for PAT Pretest	ERN 1899-1900	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:13 – 173:17.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
33	3/11/99 Letter from Howe to Burns Re Space for PAT validation	ERN 2569-2570	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:13 – 173:17.)
34	4/1/99 Letter from Howe to Burns re Space for PAT	ERN 2571-2572	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:13 – 173:17.)
35	9/10/99 Chicago Paramedic Validation Study Results Meeting Agenda	ERN 1204-1206	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 173:18 – 173:20.)
36	12/15/1999 Letter from Gebhardt to Rocks regarding cutoff score	ERN 3990	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 175:6 – 175:8.)
37-A	Final Report, Appendix A: Ride-Along Incidents	ERN 5586-5596	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:17 – 176:18.)
37-B	Final Report, Appendix B: Ergonomic Measurements	ERN 5597-5599	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
37-C	Final Report, Appendix C: Final Task List	ERN 5600-5608	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-D	Final Report, Appendix D: Task Inventory Materials	ERN 5609-5637	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-E	Final Report, Appendix E: Unweighted Task Means for Frequency, Time Spent, Importance and Physical Effort	ERN 5638-5641	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-F	Final Report, Appendix F: Essential Task Values	ERN 5642-5646	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-G	Final Report, Appendix G: List of Essential Tasks	ERN 5647-5653	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-H	Final Report, Appendix H: Results of Supplemental Questions	ERN 5654-5659	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
37-I	Final Report, Appendix I: Unweighted Personality Attribute Means for Importance and Required At Entry	ERN 5660-5661	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-J	Final Report, Appendix J: List of Essential Personality Attributes	ERN 5662-5664	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-K	Final Report, Appendix K: Physical Demands Inventory Material and Personality-Task Linkage Questionnaire	ERN 5665-5686	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-L	Final Report, Appendix L: Physical Abilities Analysis Means and Standard Deviations	ERN 5687-5689	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-M	Final Report, Appendix M: Personality Attribute – Task Linkage Means	ERN 5690-5694	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-N	Final Report, Appendix N: Work Sample Descriptions	ERN 5695-5707	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
37-O	Final Report, Appendix O: Supervisor/Peer Rating Instruction Form	ERN 5708-5718	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-P	Final Report, Appendix P: Participant Agreement and Medical Self-Report Forms	ERN 5719-5723	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-Q	Final Report, Appendix Q: Validation Testing Score Sheet	ERN 5724-5731	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-R	Final Report, Appendix R: Demographic Variables and Physical Performance Test and Work Sample Correlations	ERN 5732-5736	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-S	Final Report, Appendix S: Criterion Measures Intercorrelation Matrix	ERN 5737-5742	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
37-T	Final Report, Appendix T: Physical Performance Test and Individual Criterion Measures Correlations	ERN 5743-5744	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
37-U	Final Report, Appendix U: Comparison of Test Scores to Satisfactory and Unsatisfactory Job Performance	ERN 5745-5752	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 176:19 – 178:2.)
41	PAT Test Manual	ERN 6880-6914	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 178:23 – 179:6.)
43	PAT Instructions for Candidates	ERN 5202-5203	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:11 – 179:20.)
44	PAT Proctor Guide	ERN 1209-1202	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:11 – 179:20.)
45	Candidate Manual Instructions with 2000 Date	ERN 11041-11042	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:11 – 179:20.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
46	Video of paramedic PAT, converted to DVD in 2010	ERN 6877	Received into Evidence without Objection provided Defendant Does Not Describe the Video as a 2000 video unless an appropriate foundation is provided at trial (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:11 – 179:20.)
47	3/3/00 List of Equipment for PAT	ERN 4884-4885	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:21 – 179:23.)
48	Email from Todd Baker to Jay Silva re: standard deviations dated June 28, 2012	ERN 11761	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 179:21 – 179:23.)
51	Paramedic Training Schedule 2008	Johnson Dep. Ex. 3	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)
52	Ambulance Assist Spreadsheet	Barry Dep. Ex. 1	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
53	Ambulance Assist Spreadsheet	Barry Dep. Ex. 3	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)
54	Ambulance Assist Spreadsheet	Barry Dep. Ex. 6	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)
55	1997 CFD Bureau of Emergency Services – ambulance response data	ERN 2820	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)
56	Chicago Fire Department General Order No. 91-012	ERN 272-275	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:4 – 187:5.)
57	City of Chicago Personnel Rules, revised May 13, 2003	ERN 1-69	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 25, 2014 P.M. Tr. 187:6 – 187:7.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
60	Summary of Paramedic Physical performance test Scores from 2000 to 2009	ERN 18860-18889	<p>Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objections, provided "No member of the trial team . . . may argue or hint or suggest that it is a statistical distribution which starts [with] frequencies . . . None of that . . . can be utilized as a basis for testimony by any expert. It may not be used as a basis for . . . any witness on behalf of the City to impugn, contradict, impeach, or disagree with any conclusion that has been made by the plaintiffs' experts." (Feb. 26, 2014 P.M. Tr. 94:21 – 96:9; 147:16 – 149:5.)</p>
69	Estimate of paramedic training costs for 2004	ERN 11620	<p>Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 61:25 – 62:3.)</p>

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
70	Estimate of paramedic training costs for 2011	WRN 11621	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 61:25 – 62:3.)
71	CFD Stretcher Contract 2005 - 2008	ERN 18667-18828	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 69:3 – 69:7.)
72	CFD Stretcher Contract 2008 - 2011	ERN 11622-11740	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 70:20 – 70:23.)
73	Paramedic Candidate Performance Testing Summary Sheet	ERN 1184-1189	Received into Evidence without Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 70:24 – 71:4.)
74	Score Sheets Completed by Rhonda Vandecoevering on August 10, 2004	ERN 564, ERN 3127-3175, ERN 3177- 3189, ERN 3412, ERN 3414, ERN 3421-3475, ERN 3489, ERN 3494-3498	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 73:5 – 73:6.)
75	Score Sheets Completed by Rhonda Vandecoevering on August 11, 2004	ERN 562, ERN 3190-3230, ERN 3232-3251, ERN 3410, ERN 3476-3488, ERN 3490-3493, ERN 3499	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 73:14 – 74:8.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
76	Score Sheets Completed by Rhonda Vandecoevering on August 12, 2004	ERN 563, ERN 565, ERN 3252-3296, ERN 3306-3308, ERN 3411, ERN 3413, ERN 3417-3420, ERN 3500-3509, ERN 3521-3523, ERN 3558-3578, ERN 3586-3592, ERN 3617	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 73:14 – 74:8.)
77	Score Sheets Completed by Rhonda Vandecoevering on August 13, 2004	ERN 3316-3324, ERN 3328-3348, ERN 3355-3379, ERN 3415-3416, ERN 3512-3514, ERN 3531-3539, ERN 3543-3557, ERN 3579-3585, ERN 3599-3608, ERN 3611, ERN 3614-3616	Received into Evidence over Plaintiffs' Objection. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 73:14 – 74:8.)
78	Photographs of PAT Equipment	ERN 18829-18849	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 74:9 – 74:21.)
79	List of Paramedic Separations Since January 1990 While in Academy	ERN 18664-18666	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 P.M. Tr. 94:7 – 94:14.)
80	Deborah Gebhardt resume (2006)	ERN 4497 – 4518	Received into evidence, as are all expert resumes, unless Judge Norgle disagrees. (Feb. 26, 2014 A.M. Tr. 77:7 – 77:9.)

Trial Ex. #	Description	Bates Range/ Dep. Ex. #	Pretrial Ruling of Mag. Judge Cole
94	Salary Schedule for Uniformed Fire Department Positions	ERN013560	Received into Evidence without Objection (Feb. 26, 2014 P.M. Tr. 99:17 – 99:22.)

Dated: October 31, 2014

By: s/Susan P. Malone
Attorney for Plaintiffs

Susan P. Malone
smalonelaw@sbcglobal.net
542 S. Dearborn, Suite 610
Chicago, IL 60605
(312) 726-2638

Marni Willenson
marni@willensonlaw.com
Willenson Law, LLC
542 S. Dearborn Street, Suite 610
Chicago, IL 60605
(312) 546-4910

David Borgen (Cal. Bar No. 099354)
dborgen@gdblegal.com
Michael Caesar (Cal. Bar No. 280548)
mcaesar@gdbhlegal.com
Goldstein Borgen Dardarian & Ho
300 Lakeside Drive, Suite 10000
Oakland, CA 94612
(510) 763-9800

Joshua Karsh
jkarsh@hsplegal.com
Hughes, Socol, Piers, Resnick & Dym
70 West Madison Street, Suite 4000
Chicago, IL 60602
(312) 604-2630

By: s/Cary E. Donham
Attorney for Defendant

Timothy Swabb (ARDC No. 6193885)
Timothy.Swabb@cityofchicago.org
Alison Alvarez (ARDC No. 6281295)
alison.alvarez@cityofchicago.org
Assistants Corporation Counsel
30 N. LaSalle Street, Suite 1020
Chicago, IL 60602

Allan T. Slagel (ARDC No. 6198470)
aslagel@taftlaw.com
Cary E. Donham (ARDC No. 6199385)
cdonham@taftlaw.com
John F. Kennedy (ARDC No. 6196185)
jkennedy@taftlaw.com
Elizabeth E. Babbitt (ARDC No. 6296851)
ebabbitt@taftlaw.com
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP
111 East Wacker Drive, Suite 2800
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 527-4000

1309136_3